

**FORM 4.4 Assessment of the PhD thesis by the Evaluation Committee**

|  |
| --- |
| To be filled in by the committee coordinator and sent to [the faculty PhD coordinator](https://www.nmbu.no/en/research/phd/phdcontacts) no later than 25 working days prior to the planned public defence.  |

**This form accounts for:**

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **First** time submission:  | [ ]  “Original” thesis[ ]  “Revised” thesis | **Second** time submission:  | [ ]  “Reworked” thesis |
|  |

|  |
| --- |
| 1. **Candidate, committee, thesis**
 |
| PhD candidate: | Full name of the candidate |
| Evaluation committee: | Member 1 (Full name)Member 2 (Full name)Member 3 (committee coordinator) (Full name) |
| Title of thesis (English): | Title of thesis |
| 1. **The evaluation committee’s conclusion. The committee recommends the thesis to be:**
 |
| *First time submission;*original thesis | [ ]  Approved for public defence. [ ]  Not approved for public defence in its present form. The thesis may be subject to minor changes; within a deadline of maximum 3-month work.[ ]  Rejected. Fundamental changes are necessary. The thesis may be reworked and resubmitted one more time after minimum 6 months. |
| *First time submission;* revised thesis | [ ]  Approved for public defence.[ ]  Rejected. Fundamental changes are necessary. The thesis may be reworked, and resubmitted one more time after minimum 6 months.  |
| *Second time submission;*reworked thesis | [ ]  Approved for public defence.[ ]  Rejected for a second time. Further revision is not permitted.  |
| **Dissenting opinions, if any:** |
| *State any dissenting opinions and reasons for disagreement among committee members here* |
| 1. **The committee’s assessment of the thesis:**

*The committee members must assess the PhD thesis in accordance with* [*NMBU’s PhD regulations (section 10)*](http://www.nmbu.no/en/research/phd/regulations_guidelines) *and* [*the faculty Guidelines for the Evaluation of PhD thesis*](https://www.nmbu.no/en/research/phd/forms) *(Forms for staff, section 5). Consider strengths and weaknesses, material and methods, arguments, and conclusions.* |
| *The committee coordinator inserts here the joint written assessment report & conclusion (normally 2–3 pages).**Any individual assessment reports must accompany form 4.4 as attachments.* |
| 1. **The committee’s proposals for revisions, if any:**
 |
| *In case the committee does not recommend approval of the thesis in its present form, the committee must include an overview of the specific aspects the PhD candidate must revise.* |
| 1. **How do you assess the thesis according to the standard at your university and/ or in your field:**
 |
|

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Member 1 appraisal:** | Excellent | Very good | Average | Below average |
| Originality |[ ] [ ] [ ] [ ]
| Depth and coverage |[ ] [ ] [ ] [ ]
| Theoretical level |[ ] [ ] [ ] [ ]
| Methodological level |[ ] [ ] [ ] [ ]
| Skills in written presentation |[ ] [ ] [ ] [ ]
| Contribution to the advancement of the field |[ ] [ ] [ ] [ ]
| External relevance (applied/societal/cultural/industrial) |[ ] [ ] [ ] [ ]
|  |  |  |  |  |
| **Member 2 appraisal:** | Excellent | Very good | Average | Below average |
| Originality |[ ] [ ] [ ] [ ]
| Depth and coverage |[ ] [ ] [ ] [ ]
| Theoretical level |[ ] [ ] [ ] [ ]
| Methodological level |[ ] [ ] [ ] [ ]
| Skills in written presentation |[ ] [ ] [ ] [ ]
| Contribution to the advancement of the field |[ ] [ ] [ ] [ ]
| External relevance (applied/societal/cultural/industrial) |[ ] [ ] [ ] [ ]
|  |  |  |  |  |

 |
| 1. **Attachments accompanying form 4.4, if any:**
 |
| [ ]  Individual report from 1st opponent[ ]  Individual report from 2nd opponent[ ]  Other: |
| 1. **The committee coordinator hereby presents the committee’s PhD thesis evaluation and recommen­dation to the faculty:**
 |
| **Date:**  | ***Signature of the coordinator of the committee*** ***NB!*** *Handwritten signature is not required when the coordinator sends form 4.4 by e-mail to the faculty PhD coordinator. Date is required.* |