

**FORM 4.4 Assessment of the PhD thesis by the Evaluation Committee**

|  |
| --- |
| To be filled in by the committee coordinator and sent to [the faculty PhD coordinator](https://www.nmbu.no/en/research/phd/phdcontacts) no later than 25 working days prior to the planned public defence. |

**This form accounts for:**

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **First** time submission: | “Original” thesis  “Revised” thesis | **Second** time submission: | “Reworked” thesis |
|  | | | | | |

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 1. **Candidate, committee, thesis** | | | |
| PhD candidate: | Full name of the candidate | | |
| Evaluation committee: | Member 1 (Full name)  Member 2 (Full name)  Member 3 (committee coordinator) (Full name) | | |
| Title of thesis (English): | Title of thesis | | |
| 1. **The evaluation committee’s conclusion. The committee recommends the thesis to be:** | | | |
| *First time submission;*  original thesis | | Approved for public defence.  Not approved for public defence in its present form. The thesis may be subject to minor changes; within a deadline of maximum 3-month work.  Rejected. Fundamental changes are necessary. The thesis may be reworked and resubmitted one more time after minimum 6 months. | |
| *First time submission;* revised thesis | | Approved for public defence.  Rejected. Fundamental changes are necessary. The thesis may be reworked, and resubmitted one more time after minimum 6 months. | |
| *Second time submission;*  reworked thesis | | Approved for public defence.  Rejected for a second time. Further revision is not permitted. | |
| **Dissenting opinions, if any:** | | | |
| *State any dissenting opinions and reasons for disagreement among committee members here* | | | |
| 1. **The committee’s assessment of the thesis:**   *The committee members must assess the PhD thesis in accordance with* [*NMBU’s PhD regulations (section 10)*](http://www.nmbu.no/en/research/phd/regulations_guidelines) *and* [*the faculty Guidelines for the Evaluation of PhD thesis*](https://www.nmbu.no/en/research/phd/forms) *(Forms for staff, section 5). Consider strengths and weaknesses, material and methods, arguments, and conclusions.* | | | |
| *The committee coordinator inserts here the joint written assessment report & conclusion (normally 2–3 pages).*  *Any individual assessment reports must accompany form 4.4 as attachments.* | | | |
| 1. **The committee’s proposals for revisions, if any:** | | | |
| *In case the committee does not recommend approval of the thesis in its present form, the committee must include an overview of the specific aspects the PhD candidate must revise.* | | | |
| 1. **How do you assess the thesis according to the standard at your university and/ or in your field:** | | | |
| |  |  |  |  |  | | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | | **Member 1 appraisal:** | Excellent | Very good | Average | Below average | | Originality |  |  |  |  | | Depth and coverage |  |  |  |  | | Theoretical level |  |  |  |  | | Methodological level |  |  |  |  | | Skills in written presentation |  |  |  |  | | Contribution to the advancement of the field |  |  |  |  | | External relevance (applied/societal/cultural/industrial) |  |  |  |  | |  |  |  |  |  | | **Member 2 appraisal:** | Excellent | Very good | Average | Below average | | Originality |  |  |  |  | | Depth and coverage |  |  |  |  | | Theoretical level |  |  |  |  | | Methodological level |  |  |  |  | | Skills in written presentation |  |  |  |  | | Contribution to the advancement of the field |  |  |  |  | | External relevance (applied/societal/cultural/industrial) |  |  |  |  | |  |  |  |  |  | | | | |
| 1. **Attachments accompanying form 4.4, if any:** | | | |
| Individual report from 1st opponent  Individual report from 2nd opponent  Other: | | | |
| 1. **The committee coordinator hereby presents the committee’s PhD thesis evaluation and recommen­dation to the faculty:** | | | |
| **Date:** | | | ***Signature of the coordinator of the committee***  ***NB!*** *Handwritten signature is not required when the coordinator sends form 4.4 by e-mail to the faculty PhD coordinator. Date is required.* |